

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
2	1	C	Trevilon KV1	1.2.1	Table	NTCIP 1103 v03	ISO 15784-2:2015	RFC 5591 states: SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 did not include adequate security. A viable solution has been defined and is available for reference today. Failure to address the security issue that has already been the subject of public articles in hacker communities (who are laughing at our industry: https://www.csoonline.com/article/2466551/microsoft-subnet/hacking-traffic-lights-with-a-laptop-is-easy.html) can only be considered gross negligence.	While there is no disagreement about your points, NTCIP is currently based on SNMP v1 and the connected vehicle environment is only part of the changes proposed in v03. Add a statement that NTCIP 1202 v03 uses a SNMP v01 and was out of scope for this particular project. SNMPv3. Noted: Future revision of NTCIP 1202 v03 and a possible TMC to ASC effort is anticipated in 2017. There will be multiple efforts to address SNMPv3 hopefully within the next year. Recommended to retain SNMPv1 and SMLv1 for current 1202 v03. 9/25 Added language to sections 2.6 Security, and Annex F.3.2.2.
3		C	Siemens /DM	1.2.1	Ref	None	Identifier: V2I Hub ICD, Title: V2I Hub Interface Control Document (ICD) - Final Report March 2017, FHWA JPO	Interface Control Document that is referenced in USDOT test beds, CV pilots and USDOT professional capacity building training modules.	The reference exists in 1.2.2, Other References because it is NOT normative. In 1.2.2, updated to Identifier: V2I Hub Interface Control DocumentTitle: Integrated Vehicle-to-Infrastructure Prototype (IVP), V2I Hub Interface Control Document (ICD) - Final Report March 2017, FHWA JPO
4		C	Siemens /DM	1.5	Abbr.	None	TSCBM: Traffic Signal Controller Broadcast Message	Define TSCBM abbreviation per USDOT documentation	Added acronym, TSCBM - Traffic Signal Controller Broadcast Message
5		C	Siemens /DM	1.5	Abbr.	Signal Phase and Timing	Signal Phase and Timing as defined by SAE J2735_201603	2.5.4.1.3 correctly identifies SPaT as defined in SAE J2735, which is an over-the-air message, while other places within UCD refer to SPaT as CU to RSU, which is incorrect. Suggest the UCD consistently refer SPaT as the J2735 definition for over-the-air and TSCBM as the CU to RSU for the information from the CU need to generate SPaT	Added an entry, Traffic Signal Controller Broadcast Message (TSCBM); A message defined in the V2I Hub Interface Control Document containing signal phase and timing (SPaT) information comprised of the SNMP data objects sent by the traffic signal controller to an RSU.
6		C	Siemens /DM	2.3.3	par 2	e.g. signal phase and timing (SPaT) information	e.g. information needed by RSU to create signal phase and timing (SPaT)	CU does not broadcast J2735. CU provides information to the RSU, which creates SPaT	Changed text to, "(e.g., information needed to create signal phase and timing (SPaT) messages,"
7		C	Siemens /DM	2.8.1	e)	This includes intersection status (SPAT), environmental	This includes intersection status, environmental	States this flow as "...information provided to the RSU by local field devices", which is incorrect. SPaT is the information flow from the RSU to OBUs.	Removed (SPAT) as proposed.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
8		C	Siemens /DM	3.3.3	notes		Add second note: SPaT as defined by SAE J2735_201603	J2735 defines SPaT defines SPaT as the over-the-air message. Requirements for the CU to control the over-the-air SPaT behavior, not the behavior of the information from the CU to the RSU.	Disagree. The Note in this section is a note on the PRL. However, verified that similar language, "as defined by SAE J2735", existed at the first occurrence of the acronym SPaT in the Feature (needs) section (Section 2.5.4) and requirements section (Section 3.5.4.1.3)
9	2	C	CSTChan2	2.8		Update existing text for National ITS Architecture v8.0, now known as ARC-IT.			Done.
10	3	C	ORDOT Boettcher1	3.5.2.2.1.1 .9.9	p.178,	has not be	has not been	grammar	Done.
11		C	Peek/Simpson			Add a function in the io-map for input assignment. We called it Pedestrian_Presence_1 to Pedestrian_Presence_32.		A pedestrian detector is typically used to detect the presence of a pedestrian desiring to traverse a pedestrian crossing as opposed to detecting the presence of a pedestrian IN THE pedestrian crosswalk.Thus, there should be a separate entity, perhaps called a pedestrian presence detector for the latter.	Added definition of a pedestrian detector. Adding requirements to support configuring a pedestrian detector to be used as a presence (of a pedestrian in a pedestrian crosswalk) detector. Also added a pedestrianDetectorOptions object to allow a pedestrian detector to be used as a presence detector. Also updated and renamed the description of the movementManeuverPedDetector and movementManeuverBicycleDetector to movementManeuverPedPresence and movementManeuverBicyclePresence to
12		C	Peek/Simpson			We used the current movementManeuverPedDetector object to decide if there was a ped presence conflict for that movement or not. This objects name/description will most likely need to be changed because it has nothing to do with actual ped detection. Its more inline with the ped presence operation.		A pedestrian detector is typically used to detect the presence of a pedestrian desiring to traverse a pedestrian crossing as opposed to detecting the presence of a pedestrian IN THE pedestrian crosswalk.Thus, there should be a separate entity, perhaps called a pedestrian presence detector for the latter.	Added definition of a pedestrian detector. Adding requirements to support configuring a pedestrian detector to be used as a presence (of a pedestrian in a pedestrian crosswalk) detector. Also added a pedestrianDetectorOptions object to allow a pedestrian detector to be used as a presence detector. Also updated and renamed the description of the movementManeuverPedDetector and movementManeuverBicycleDetector to movementManeuverPedPresence and movementManeuverBicyclePresence to

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
13		C	Siemens /DM	4.2.5	8	Generate SPaT...	Generate information for SPaT...	CU contributes information for SPaT	The comment is actually for Section 4.2.4. Changed to Generate SPAT informtion from the outputs.
14	3a	SE	Intelight DC	4.2.7		Programmable logic and public MIBs	<p>Remove programmable logic from the standard and replace with the following statement to satisfy the user need:</p> <p>The vendor shall provide all NTCIP Management Information Base (MIBs) files associated with the licensed controller software including manufacturer specific and extended objects. The vendor places no limitations on the re-distribution and re-use of the MIBs associated with the licensed controller software.</p>	<p>There is a real user need to have programmable logic. It solves a lot of corner case problems. But creating a single design that balances the flexibility and simplicity of each existing implementation is unreasonable and uncesessary. The real user need for interoperability to to have the ability to edit/manage/upload/download all of the programmable logic settings from any third party NTCIP manager. This goal is much better accomplished by specifying that all MIBs be publicly available rather than forcing all implementations to use a less flexible design.</p> <p>Programmable logic is really just one aspect of the controller that is part of this broader point. No public agency today is satisfied with managing their controllers using only the 1202v2 objects. Even though 1202v3 adds a lot more this will not change. As long as a device uses even a single manufacturer specfic obejct not defined in the standard users will not be satisfied with 1202 alone.</p> <p>In applications where the consumer of the object data is a computer algorithm: CV, adaptive control, performance measures there is real value in standardizing the interface and that is what we should focus on in 1202. Programmable logic is not one of those applications.</p>	<p>Proposed: he vendor shall provide all NTCIP Management Information Base (MIBs) files associated with the controller software including manufacturer specific and extended objects. The vendor places no limitations on the re-distribution and re-use of the MIBs associated with the controller software.</p> <p>The vendor shall provide all NTCIP Management Information Base (MIBs) files associated with the controller software including manufacturer specific and extended objects. The vendor places no limitations on the re-distribution and re-use of the MIBs associated with the licensed controller software.Actuated Signal Controller (ASC) devices shall adhere to the conformance requirements specified in the above as a minimum to claim compliance to this standard. If a device supports the functionality defined in NTCIP 1202 v03, then the device shall implement the functionality in format. ToBeDone. Rosenbohm to provide proposed language.</p>
15	4	C	Trevilon KV2	5	Gen	SMIv1 MIB	SMIv2 MIB	The SMIv1 MIB defined in section 5 should be reformatted into the SMIv2 MIB, which is the basis for SNMPv3 operations. This also will resolve confusion created by the SMIv1 format (i.e., SMIv1 defines things like STATUS, which is better handled in SMIv2)	For now, proposed NTCIP 1202 v03 is required to conform to NTCIP 8004 v02. In future, BSP2 WG may address. Noted. 9/18 9/22 Noted: Future revision of NTCIP 1202 v03 and a possible TMC to ASC effort is anticipated in 2017. There will be multiple efforts to address SNMPv3 hopefully within the next year. Recommended to retain SNMPv1 and SMIv1 for current 1202 v03.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
	5	C	PeekMS 14	5.10.2.10	pg 384	<p>overlapConflictingPedPhases OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX OCTET STRING ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> Each octet is a Phase (number) that shall be a pedestrian modifier phase for the overlap. The phase number value shall not exceed the maxPhases object value. If the overlap type is 'normal', a non-null value would omit the overlap when the ped is active (in the walk or clearance interval). Upon completion of the ped active and upon completion of a clearance interval (MUTCD requires 3 seconds), the overlap is allowed to start. <Object Identifier> 1.3.6.1.4.1.1.1206.4.2.1.9.2.1.10" ::= { overlapEntry 10 }</p>	<p>overlapConflictingPedPhases OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX OCTET STRING ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> Each octet is a Phase (number) that shall be a pedestrian modifier phase for the overlap. The phase number value shall not exceed the maxPhases object value. If the overlap type is 'normal': A non-null value would omit the overlap when the ped is active (in the walk or clearance interval). Upon completion of the ped active and upon completion of a clearance interval (MUTCD requires 3 seconds), the overlap is allowed to proceed to the green state. If the overlap type is 'FYA Three/Four Section': A non-null value would maintain the overlap red state when the ped is active (in the walk or clearance interval). Upon completion of the ped active and upon completion of a clearance interval (MUTCD</p>		<p>Asked everyone to review on their own. Language changes. 9/15 Patrick to send an e-mail. NOTE: 9/22 To be done.</p>

16

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
17	6	C	PeekMS 13	5.10.2.2	pg 379	<p>overlapType OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER { other(1), normal (2), minusGreenYellow (3), pedestrianNormal (4), fYA3-1 (5), fYA4-1 (6), fYAPed (7), fRA3 (8), fRA4 (9), transitNormal (10), transit-2 (11), protectedPermissive (12) } ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> The type of overlap operation for this row. The types are as follows: other: The overlap operates in another mode than those described herein. normal: The overlap output shall be controlled by the overlapIncludedPhases when this type is indicated. The overlap output shall be green in the following situations: (1) when an overlap included phase is green. (2) when an overlap included phase is yellow (or red</p>	<p>PedestrianNormal: The overlap output shall be controlled by the overlapIncludedPhases when this type is indicated. The overlap output shall be Walk in the following situations: (1) when an overlap included phase is green. (2) when an overlap included phase is yellow (or red clearance) and an overlap included phase is next. (3) when an overlap included phase is Walk. (4) when an overlap included phase is in a pedestrian clearance interval and an overlap included phase is next. Upon completion of the Walk interval, the overlap enters the pedestrian clearance interval. The overlap output shall exit the pedestrian clearance interval to steady Don't Walk when the programmed pedestrian clearance time expires. The overlap output shall be steady Don't Walk whenever the overlap walk and ped clear are not ON.</p> <p>FYA Three Section: Intended for a 3-section head where the</p>	<p>For the PedestrianNormal are we sure we want to allow the ped overlap even if the parent has no ped, so options 1 and 2? Clearing this ped might have adverse affects on coordination.</p>	<p>Asked everyone to review on their own. Language changes. 9/15 Patrick to send an e-mail. 9/22 To be done.</p>
18	7	C	KLD/Wu ping Xin1	5.12.1		SYNTAX OCTET STRING(SIZE(2..12))	SYNTAX OCTET STRING(SIZE(4..12))	<p>The minimum size of the OCTET STRING should be 4 bytes: ascBlockDataType (1byte), ascBlockDataID(1byte), ascBlockIndex1(1byte), ascBlockQuantity1(1byte). The original minimum size of 2 bytes comes from ascBlockDataType + ascBlockDataID, which is moot. In what situation that a client will send ascBlockGetControl, without specifying indexes?</p>	<p>Make change. Accepted - 9/20.</p>

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
19	7a	O	Intelight DC			spat	Keep spat objects defined in terms of absolute time. Add a new ascGlobalTime2 object representing UTC time on the controller with sub-second resolution encoded in whatever format J2735 uses for representing UTC time. Specify that the value represents the ASC UTC time at the moment the object was encoded and transmitted.	Keep the SPAT objects defined in terms of absolute time, but qualify that the time is relative to the ASC and may not reflect true time. The ASC must transmit its absolute time to the RSU at a high frequency over a low latency connection. The RSU is responsible for compensating for any offset or drift in the ASC absolute time. This essentially achieves the same result as having the the ASC transmit the SPAT objects using delta times at a high frequency. But, the payload of the of SPAT objects will not change as frequently and won't need to be transmitted as much	Items 7a, 7b, 7c related to extension of time.
20	7b	O	Intelight DC			spat ASC block	Keep the spat standard ASC block. But, in addition copy the payload of the spat ASC block OER encoded into the definition of a new OCTECT_STRING object blob: rsuAscSpatComposite	Accessing standard ASC block objects from 2 managers will cause problems if both managers are setting ascBlockGetControl at the same time. A standard ASC spat block will probably work fine for 1) ASC-manager to RSU-agent(sending SETs), and 2)ASC-agent to RSU-manager (sending traps). But, I don't think it will work for 3)RSU-manager to ASC-agent (polling GETs). In case 3 it is likely that the ASC will be communicating with 2 managers: RSU and a central system. If we create a custom blob: rsuAscSpatComposite that contains the same payload as the ASC block then multiple managers can GET the object concurrently	Relates to or is extension of time discussion. Proposal is to add a new object, and language to beginning of SPaT block, that indicates ASC and RSU lanugage may not be synchronized. Discussion to defer future consideration of SPaT time, until clarity on time stamps is known. At that time, propose new object that captures millisecond global time from the controller. different from spatTimestamp, at transmission versus data capture time. Crawford to work with Chan to understand current time discussion, including 'disciplined' v undisciplined, and develop additional object as appropriate. Chan/Crawford 9/22. Item 7b.
21	7c	C	Intelight DC			spat	rsuAscSpatChangeId OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (1..65535) ACCESS read-only STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> CRC or hash of the contents of the rsuAscSpat ASC block.	Create a change ID/CRC for the ASC spat block. The NTCIP manager can GET this object to detect if the contents of ASC spat block have changed.	After discussing with the commenter, a NTCIP manager can use a timestamp that is broadcasted instead.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
22	8	C	KLD/Wu ping Xin2	5.12.2		SYNTAX OCTET STRING(SIZE(2..484))	SYNTAX OCTET STRING(SIZE(6..484))	The minimum size of the OCTET STRING should be 6 bytes: ascBlockDataType 1 Byte ascBlockDataID 1 Byte ascBlockIndex1 1 Byte ascBlockQuantity1 1 Byte totalQtyOfDataSequence 2 Bytes (1 byte for Length, 1 byte for value). How is this maximum 484 bytes determined?	Overall packet size should not exceed the snmp-maxPacketSize in NTCIP 1103 v03. SYNTAX OCTET STRING (SIZE(6..65535)). Patrick to verify size. Accepted - 9/20.
23	9	C	PeekMS 15	5.13.4.3	pg 395	cabinetTempSensorCurrentReading OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (-127..127) ACCESS read-only STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> Indicates the current reading, in degrees Celsius, of the temperature sensor. <Valid Value Rule> The value -55 shall indicate a temperature of -55 degrees Celsius or lower. The value 85 shall indicate a temperature of 85 degrees Celsius or higher. The value -56 shall indicate an error condition or missing value. <Object Identifier> 1.3.6.1.4.1.1.1206.4.2.1.12.4.1.3 <Unit> degrees Celsius" DEFVAL { -56 } ::= { cabinetTempSensorStatusEntry 3 }	cabinetTempSensorCurrentReading OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (-128..127) ACCESS read-only STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> Indicates the current reading, in degrees Celsius, of the temperature sensor. <Valid Value Rule> The value -55 shall indicate a temperature of -55 degrees Celsius or higher. The value 85 shall indicate a temperature of 85 degrees Celsius or lower. The value 127 shall indicate an error condition or missing value.		I believe the definition is correct. The proposal is rejected. However, the WG agreed to change range to -128 to 127. -128 to be error condition. 9/15.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
24	10	C	PeekMS 16	5.13.4.4	pg 395	cabinetTempSensorHighThreshold OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (-56..85) ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> Indicates the high value of the temperature, in degrees Celsius, associated with this temperature sensor above which would generate a warning.. This value should not be lower than the value of the cabinetTempSensorLowThreshold object.		In what object would this warning be? Same question for cabinetTempSensorLowThreshold	Bit 3 of the unitAlarmStatus4 object (Section 5.4.32). Add this reference to the definition. Correct the -127 to 127. Use -128 to disable the alarm. Accept as revised. Change lower threshold also. 9/15.
25	11	C	PeekMS 17	5.13.6.4	pg 397	cabinetHumidityThreshold OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..101) ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> Indicates the relative humidity, in percent, within the CU cabinet above which the humidity threshold alarm shall be activated.		In what object is the humidity threshold alarm?	Bit 3 of the unitAlarmStatus4 object (Section 5.4.32). Add this reference to the definition. Accepted - 9/15.
26	12	C	PeekMS 18	5.14.1.3	pg 399	asclOactivateRequirement OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..255) ACCESS read-only		This object should be read-write	It was intended that the activation requirements be determined by the firmware developer or specified by the governing entity and not be editable by the user. No change - 9/15.
27	13	C	PeekMS 19	5.14.1.3	pg 399	in asclOactivateRequirement Bit 4 – restart -- ASC is waiting to restart	If the changes are the to current iomap, the new changes will only take affect a restart.		This is only true if the restart (bit 4) requirement is set. Will revise text. Accepted - 9/15. To be done.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
28	14	C	PeekMS 20	5.14.4	pg 401			<p>asclOmapFuncType INTEGER, -- 1=STD, else nemaPrivate vendor code</p> <p>The text in red is not correct needs to be custom (1) and standard (2)</p>	Accepted. Editorial issue. Current text does not match 5.14.4.11 description of asclOmapFuncType. 9/15. To be done.
29	15	C	PeekMS 21	5.14.4	pg 401			<p>As a suggestion, for the PNN objects like asclOmapFuncType OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER { custom (1), standard (2) }</p> <p>Why not make the values 0 = custom and any other number is the PNN. Then you can eliminate the associate PNN object, like in this example the asclOmapFuncPNN object. In addition for the asclOmapFuncPtype, seems like we don't need this object. The asclOmapFunction will be a number referencing the standard enums or the manufacturers enums depending on the asclOmapFuncType setting.</p>	It was pointed out during the walkthrough that a manufacturer may want to have more than one function map (function type), such as one for 2070 style cabinets and one for NEMA style cabinets. These objects are designed to allow this (more than one function type mapping per manufacturer PNN). PNN and function type be combined into a single object - 9/15 - to be done..
30	16	C	PeekMS 22	5.14.4	pg 401	asclOmapDescription		<p>I think it is cleaner to create a separate table indexed by asclOmapNumber for each io maps description. Seems like table indexes are getting mixed here. This is the general approach throughout the rest of the MIB. This also make the block unnecessarily big.</p>	<p>During the walkthrough the original design of many several tables was combined into two (input and output) which were then nearly identical so they were combined.</p> <p>A table row is 49 bytes (including a byte for description length) is only 49 bytes, 16 bytes if the description is put in a separate block.</p> <p>This is the only 3-index table in the MIB, but there are 3-index tables in other specs (1209). Pull out description into a separate block. Two tables - input and output so only double-index, remove the triple-index - 9/15. To be done.</p>

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
31	17	C	PeekMS 23	5.14.6.2	pg 410	ascIomapOutputFuncTable, ascIomapInputFuncTable, ascPLGinputsTable, ascPLGoutputsTable		Recommend removing these since the enum in the MIB is sufficient. If we don't remove them, we should support tables for each manufactures enums as well. Same goes for the tables in the logic processing section.	These are the way for the central to retrieve the I/O map function names. Without these the functions names and enum values would have to be typed into the central. They aren't expected to be uploaded often, maybe only once per controller type. Will look at adding the manufacturer's enum/PNN number into the table. Under consideration - 9.15 To be done.
32	18	C	PeekMS 24	5.15.1.1	pg 423			ascPLGinputType, 1. Rename to ascPLGinputFuncs, 2. we will need to state that a manufacturer can have an enum defined as well? We will also have to allow the assigning of a manPLGinputFuncs.	I think we thought calling these "functions" would be confused with the logic gate function. To use a manufacturer specific pin as the input to a logic gate, I/O map the custom input to a "logicInput". 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.
33	19	C	PeekMS 25	5.15.2.1	pg 426			AscPLGoutputType, 1. Change to AscPLGoutputFuncs we will need to state that a manufacturer can have an enum defined as well? We will also have to allow the assigning of a manPLGoutputFuncs.	See 21. 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.
34	20	C	PeekMS 26	5.15.3.5	pg 430	ascPLGgateInput1Type AscPLGinputType, ascPLGgateInput1TypeIndex INTEGER,		Recommend something like this: ascPLGgateInput1Type, 0 = custom, rest is the PNN that reference the manufacturer enum to use, ascPLGgateInput1Func, depending on ascPLGgateInput1Type its AscPLGinputFunc or ManPLGinputFunc ascPLGgateInput1FuncIndex INTEGER, This is for all inputs.	Manufacturer-specific I/O was intended to be supported by the generic "logicInput" and "logicOutput" I/O mapping. Part of PL topic. 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.
35	21	C	PeekMS 27	5.15.3.5	pg 430	ascPLGgateFunction		Rename to ascPLGgateOperation	Group can discuss "inputType" and "gateFunction" vs "inputFunc" and "gateOperation". 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
36	22	C	PeekMS 28	5.15.3.5	pg 430	ascPLGgateOutputType AscPLGoutputType, ascPLGgateOutputTypeIndex INTEGER,		ascPLGgateOutputType 0 = custom, rest is PNN to reference ManPLGoutputFunc ascPLGgateOutputFunc, depending on ascPLGgateOutputType its AscPLGoutputFuncs or ManPLGoutputFunc ascPLGgateOutputFuncIndex INTEGER,	See 23. 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.
37	23	C	PeekMS 29	5.15.3.5.3 1	pg 439	ascPLGgateOutputStatus OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..1) ACCESS read-only STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> The object returns the current value of the gate output. This object will always return on (1) for an output that is active but has an output mode of flashing. (0) output is off (1) output is on <Object Identifier> 1.3.6.1.4.1.1.1206.4.2.1.14.3.5.1.31" ::= { ascPLGgateEntry 31 }		Change range to 255 and text to: The object returns the current state of the gate output: 0 – Off. 1 – On. 2 - flash30fpm 3 - flash60fpm 4 - flash100fpm 5 - flash150fpm 6 - flash300fpm 7 to 254 reserved. 255 – Not in use.	I see no problem with this, group can decide. 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.
38	24	C	PeekMS 30	5.15.3.5.3 2	pg 439	ascPLGgateOutputRawStatus		Remove, not sure we need this?	Intended for driving a display or debugging, usefulness would depend on flash rate and read speed. 9/27 - Overcome by the removal of programmable logic from the proposed NTCIP 1202 v03.
39	25	SE	PeekMS 31	5.17.3	pg 442	rsuPortEntry		We need a udp port number added here.	Will add an object in the table to store a UDP port number for RSU communications. Leave as a UDP only - Accepted 9/20. Added rsuPortNumber object.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
40	25a	SE	Intelight DC	5.2.2.30		phasePedWalkOffsetTime	replace phasePedWalkOffsetTime with "phasePedAdvanceWalkTime" and "phasePedDelayTime"	Prefer to have 2 positive only objects instead of one negative/positive object. I can't think of any other read/write configuration objects that can be represented with negative values. It will be easier to implement UIs if the objects are positive only. Yes, UIs could do some conversions, but it will be simpler to not have a special case. Also, I would guess that most existing implementations use the 2 separate object approach.	Add the math. 9/28. Or 2 objects (as developed) and add them together.
41	26	C	PeekMS 4	5.3.10.6	pg 301	pedestrianDetectorSampleDurati on OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..65535) ACCESS read-write		This object should be read only?	Accepted - 9/15. Patrick to double-check and add clarifications if necessary.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
42	27	C	PeekMS 1	5.3.5.5	pg 292	<p>volumeOccupancyPeriodV3 OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..65535) ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> This object indicates the number of seconds (0-3600 seconds) that comprise the Volume/Occupancy/Speed collection period. When the collection period expires the device shall increment the volumeOccupancySequence, update the volumeOccupancyTable entries and reset the volume occupancy timer. If the value is 0, the value in volumeOccupancyPeriod is used if indicated (has a valid non-zero value). If both the volumeOccupancyPeriod and volumeOccupancyPeriodV3 are 0, then no sampling is to be performed. If both the volumeOccupancyPeriod and volumeOccupancyPeriodV3 are non-zero then the volumeOccupancyPeriod takes precedence. A value of 65535 indicates that the sample period equal to</p>		Why are we limiting the range to 3600? Why not make it 1..65534? This goes for all sample periods (pedestrianDetectorPeriod).	This is consistent with NTCIP 1209 v02. There's a concern with an extended range, there's a possibility of overrunning the containers. No change was made. Accepted - 9/15.
43	28	C	PeekMS 2	5.3.5.7	Pg 293	<p>detectorSampleDuration OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..65535) ACCESS read-write</p>		This object should be read only?	Accepted - 9/15. Patrick to double-check and add clarifications if necessary.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
44	29	C	PeekMS 3	5.3.7.8		pedestrianButtonPush OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..255) ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> The minimum amount of time, in tenths of a second, a pedestrian call button must be pressed to actuate additional accessible features such as increased pedestrian crossing times. A value of 0 indicates that all accessible pedestrian signal (APS) features are disabled. <Object Identifier> 1.3.6.1.4.1.1.1206.4.2.1.2.7.1.8 <Unit> tenth of a second" DEFVAL { 0 } ::= { pedestrianDetectorEntry 8 }		Suggest referencing the objects in the phase table that are "additional accessible features"	Add (See phasePedAlternateClearance and phasePedAlternateWalk objects). Accepted - 9/15.
45	30	C	PeekMS 5	5.4.22.2.2	pg 317			How does unitTimeSourceCommanded interact with unitTimeSource in the unitTimeTable? They are both read-write, and they do the same thing.	unitTimeSourceCommanded indicates which time source is intended to be used. The table is intended to indicate the possible time sources and its status. Perhaps unitTimeSource should be read only. See notes. Accepted until amended - 9/15.
46	31	C	CSTChan1	5.4.22.3		Reat Time	Real Time	spelling	Change made.
47	32	C	PeekMS 8	5.4.23.10	pg 327	serialBus3Fault		This object should be read only?	Change to read only. Accepted -9/15.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
48	33	C	PeekMS 6	5.4.23.4	pg 324			The ecfgIpAddr, ecfgNetMask, ecfgGateway and ecfgDNS objects need to be used for static allocations and should remain read-write no matter what the DHCP setting. Recommend renaming these objects to: ecfgStaticIpAddr, ecfgStaticNetMask, ecfgStaticGateway and ecfgStaticDNS. There should be a status table to show the current values of these objects. If DHCP is disabled then the status values of these object will be the same as the static settings. If DHCP is enabled then the status values will be the DHCP assigned values. This allows a user to program static ip values and switch between DHCP and the static values dynamically.	Add set of objects for static address that are always read-write, make current objects read-only to reflect the current IP address whether DHCP or static. Accepted - 9/15. Added ecfgStaticIpAddr, ecfgStaticNetMask, ecfgStaticGateway, and ecfgStaticDNS.
49	34	C	PeekMS 7	5.4.23.9	PG 327	serialBus1Fault OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..255) ACCESS read-write		This object should be read only?	Change to read only. Accepted -9/15.
50	35	C	PeekMS 9	5.4.27	pg 329			Seems like the configParameterSetsDefTable is missing a list of OIDS and values to use. Recommend one of 2 options: 1. Have an octet sting in this table that has length, OID, value repeated. 2. Have a separate OID value table that this table indexes with an octet string.	Set up the OID value table, with the OID and an octet string, similar to a dynamic object. Tabled - 9/15 - clarify or delete. Start a question of the day, with a deadline of Wednesday for resolution. Agreed to delete - 9/28. Add text to Annex E.
51	36	C	PeekMS 10	5.5.3	pg 334	maximum3: the internal Maximum 2 Timing shall be effective while coordination is running a pattern.	maximum3: the internal Maximum 3 Timing shall be effective while coordination is running a pattern.		Make change. Accepted - 9/15.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
52	37	C	PeekMS 11	5.6.3	pg 346	timebaseAscActionTable		Should add an index into the configParameterSetDefTable	timebaseAscConfigParameter OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER (0..255) ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> This value represents the index of the configuration parameter set (configParameterSetNumber) that shall be active when this Action is active. If this value is 0, then no change to the configuration parameter set is made. A SET of a value that has exceeds maxConfigParameterSets shall return a badValue(3) error. <Object Identifier> 1.3.6.1.4.1.1206.4.2.1.5.3.1.5" DEFVAL { 0 } ::= { timebaseAscActionEntry 5 } Tabled - 9/15 See #36.Overcombe by events - deleted 9/28
53		C	Siemens /Valdez		movementManeuverSatatusData definition	movementManeuver...y.x	movementManeuver.....x.y	the movementManeuverTable entry is indexed with {channelNumber, movementManeuverIndex}. Thus, since channelNumber here is using .x, all the movementManeuver objects should be x.y.	Change has been made.
54		C	Siemens /Valdez		movementManeuverSatatusData definition	ascCurrentTick.0, movementManeuverData...	asCurrentTick.0, channelMovementCount, movementManeuverData...	Since the movementManeuverStatus block includes a sequence, there should be a byte (suggest channelMovementCount) that declares how many movementManeuverDatas follow. movementManeuverStatus would then contain a sequence of sequences.	Based on information in movementManeuverBitMask, upon receiving the entire block, the number of channels in the block can be determined. Upon speaking with Mr. Valdez, it was determined that the count byte, signalStatusNumChannel, appeared in signalStatusBlock. Since the purpose of these blocks is to minimize bandwidth, the signalStatusNumChannel was deleted.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
55		C	Siemens/Valdez			movementManeuverStatusData ::= SEQUENCE { channelNumber.x, movementManeuverCount.x, movementManeuverIndex.y.x, }	::= SEQUENCE { channelNumber.x, movementManeuverCount.x, movementChannelManeuverData SEQUENCE OF movementChannelManeuverStatusData }	movementManeuverStatusData contains a sequence of data inside of it, yet that is not properly reflected in the definition.	This is the same comment as above.
56	38	SE	PeekMS 32	6	pg 466	Block Object Definitions		Did someone cross-reference the new blocks to each added object to make sure each read-write object is accounted for?	It was cross-referenced in an earlier version, but not recently. Will be performed.
57	39	C	PeekMS 33	6.46	pg 498	AsciOMapBlockData		cabinetHumidityThreshold should not be in this block.	Will remove.
58	40	C	Parsons Wyatt	6.48		AscPIgDefBlock index 1 is used twice, needs to be changed to index 2			Corrected.
59	41	C	PeekMS 34	7.2.3	pg 505	movementStatusEntry		remove movementIndex, this is a single index table, index by channelNumber. Remove all reference to movementIndex	Accepted. - 9/20.
60	42	C	PeekMS 35	7.2.3	pg 505	movementAdvisorySpeed		We need to program the advisory speed table index octet to channel mapping. This should be in the channel table?	Accepted - 9/20. Patrick to make the change. Patrick to double check the index for all tables.
61	43	C	PeekMS 36	7.2.3	pg 505	movementStatusTable		Don't need movementNextTime, redundant with movementStartTime	Not if the movement is currently active. If the movement is currently active, then movementStartTime indicates WHEN the movement started while the movementNextTime indicates when the movement will next start. Discussed - 9/20
62	44	C	PeekMS 37	7.2.3	pg 505	movementMinTimeToChange, movementMaxEndTime, movementLikelyEndTime		These objects should have the same naming convention. Propose: movementMinEndTime, movementMaxEndTime and movementLikelyEndTime	Accepted - 9/20. Remove the reference to the SAE J2735.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
63	45	C	PeekMS 12	7.2.3.2	pg 506	movementState		does not have the textual descriptions for the values	Unfortunately, due to the copyright agreement with SAE International, who owns SAE J2735, you'll have to reference SAE J2735 to determine the movement values. NTCIP 1202 v03 is allowed to include descriptions if the descriptions clarify a potential ambiguity, but this is not the case for movementState. See edit Notes in the Word document. 9/15 To be done.
64	46	C	NEMAJJ	Annex H		NTCIP 1201 v03-Derived Functional Requirements and Dialogs [Normative]	NTCIP 1201 v03- and NTCIP 1103 v03-Derived Functional Requirements and Dialogs [Normative]	Annex H includes both NTCIP 1201 v03-derived and NTCIP 1103 v03-derived FR & Dialogs. Change Heading.	9/18 Accepted
65	47	SE	PeekMS 38	F.3.3.3	pg 701	It is expected that the CV Roadside Process will make any time adjustments necessary before the SPAT message is broadcast.	Remove or edit this text. In some cases, the controller can adjust the time inside the SAPT message and the RSU does nothing.		Patrick to propose objects to support both possibilities for resolving time differences - 9/15. 9/20: Agreed that Patrick to develop the block object using delta times. Add a note/reqt that the delta times works for low latency interfaces. Patrick to look if we can get RSU time - support RSU as a NTP server? support for ASC to be management station or agent across the ASC-RSU interface to remain. SPAT Blob will not be supported once this block is created. To be done.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
66	48	C	Trevilon KV3	Gen	Gen	Omission	Add a "Security Considerations" section. This section should warn readers that using versions of SNMP prior to v3 in a connected vehicle environment compromises the safety of drivers and exposes the deploying agency to significant legal liability.	Since 1993 (RFC 1543), the IETF has ~required~ all RFCs to include a security considerations section in their standards. In other words, if you try to submit a MIB to the IETF that had complete industry support, it would be rejected without a security considerations section. (The content for this section is defined in RFC 3552.) One of the SNMPv3 RFCs (3416) even points out that: Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPSec), there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed access to management information. In other words, lower-layer security is insufficient; you need to protect the payload. SNMPv1 provides no mechanism to do this. Nor do our MIB documents. Until the security issue is addressed, the review of the standard is meaningless; deployment of signal controllers using SNMPv1 jeopardizes the safety of the public.	Add a statement to Section 2.6 Security. "Note: Users should be aware that at the time of this publication, NTCIP 1202 v03 uses SNMP v1 as referenced by NTCIP 1103 v03, a normative reference. Later versions of SNMP provide additional security but is out of scope for this particular project, thus an agency is encouraged to consider security implications..
67		C	Intelight DC		5.4.22		Remove the unitTimeTable. Keep unitTimeSourceCommanded. Keep unitTimeSourceCurrent. Change unitTimeSourceStatus to be a scalar object indicating the status for unitTimeSourceCurrent.	If the unitTimeTable is fully populated it implies that each time source agent is continuously running in the background and updating the unitTimeSourceStatus. This may not give the expected result in all cases. It would be better to simplify the design and just have one commanded time source and one time source status for the whole device	Some stakeholders wanted to also know the status of all the potential clock sources so if a different time source is to be selected, an operator can check the status of the clock source before commanding a new clock source. Table not needed, but scalar object is helpful. Add unitTimeSourceStatus as a scalar object. 9/28

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
68		SE	Intelight DC		5.4.22.2. 3	unitTimeSourceStatus OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER { notActive (1), active (2), dataError (3), dataTimeOutError (4), pendingUpdate (5), nonSequential (6) } ... nonSequential: A non-sequential clock change occurrence. This value shall live for 10 seconds then resets or on read.	removing the nonSequential state from this object. There are other objects under the ascClock node that can be used to detect non-sequential clock change.	The nonSequential state indicates it will be cleared on read. What constitutes a read? If a User Interface (either local or remote) is polling this read only status object then depending on the poll rate, the state may briefly blip on then go off.	This value shall live for 10 seconds then resets or on read. Set a trap and an event. Accepted. 9/20.
69		C	Intelight DC		4.2.7	configuration parameter sets	Remove from standard	It is not clear what paramaters can safely be siwtched in a parameter set, or exacly how a paramaeter set is switched/managed, or how transactions affect parameter sets. Recommend removing parameter sets from the standard	Deleted. Overcome by evenets. 9/28

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
70		SE	Intelight DC		5.15	Programmable logic	Remove from standard	<p>This appears to be a reasonable design, but I would guess that every existing implementation is quite different. I would argue that for programmable logic we don't need every ASC to behave the same. Applications such as CV, adaptive control, performance measures do require a standard ASC interface. But, I believe the only application for a standard programmable logic interface would be a database editor and even that use case will fail as soon as manufacturers implement custom extensions to the programmable logic input/output enumerations.</p> <p>The proposed design is not flexible enough to implement custom counters/timers, persistent values, or simple conditional logic. Intelight's existing implementation is somewhat similar but allows full integer values for the operands with additional numeric operators (increment/decrement/modulus/etc) for the logic function. If we were to adopt this design it would be a reduction in functionality and we would be forced to provide dual mode operation: native or ntcp.</p> <p>Recommend removing programmable logic from the standard</p>	Or at least state that any mechanism needs to be accessed by the central system via a publicly available MIB format.
71		C	Intelight DC		5.4.23.4	EthernetConfigTable	append the word "static" IP settings: efcgStaticIPAddr, efcgStaticNetMask, efcgStaticGateway, efcgStaticDNS. These objects only apply to a static Ethernet mode and are always read/write	repurposing efcgIpAddr to be read only during DHCP is confusing and may be problematic for blocks, upload download, etc. I would prefer to have a separate read only NetworkInterfaceAddressTable	Already done.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
72		C	Intelight DC		5.4.23.4	Ethernet status	Create a new read-only networkInterfaceAddressTable with coulmsn: networkInterfaceNumber, networkInterfaceName (octet string ascii name of interface), networkInterfacelIPv4Address (octect string ascii representation of the current IPv4 address in CIDR notation)	I propose this new status table which is primarily used to report the IPv4 address of an Ethernet interface configured as a DHCP client. But this table should also display all of the IP interfaces that have a IPv4 address assigned to them, even if those interfaces are not defined by this standard (bridges and wifi). An example of this table might look like: Name Address eth0 10.5.5.221/24 br0 192.168.0.1/24 In this case eth0 is assigned an IPv4 address of 10.5.5.221 with a subnet mask of 255.255.255.0. eth1 does not have a IPv4 assigned to it, but is part of bridge br0 which is given a IPv4 address of 192.168.0.1/24 by the DHCP server	Addressed in the previous comment. - 9/28
73		C	Intelight DC		5.4.23.4	ecfgDHCPenable	change ecfgDHCPenable to ecfgMode (other, static, DHCPClient)	This clarifies that DHCP is client only. The "other" enumeration allows the Ethernet address to be configured with some other mechanisim not defined by the standard, perhaps DHCP server or included as part of a bridge interface.	ecfgMode OBJECT-TYPE SYNTAX INTEGER { other (1), static (2), DHCPclient (3) } ACCESS read-write STATUS mandatory DESCRIPTION "<Definition> This object determines how the IPv4 interface is configured: other (1) the interface is configured with some other mechanism not defined by this standard static (2) the interface is configured using the static values in this table DHCPclient (3) the interface is configured via DHCP request <Object Identifier> 1.3.6.1.4.1.1.1206.4.2.1.3.23.4.1.5" DEFVAL { disable } ::= { ethernetConfigEntry 5 } - Need to copy over to MS's comments. Proposal accepted - 9/28. To be done.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
74		C	Siemens /Valdez	7.2.9	move mentManeu verSatat usData definition	SEQUECE { channelNumber.x, movementManeuverCount.x, movementManeuverIndex.y.x, ...}	SEQUENCE { channelNumber.x, movementManeuverCount, statusData SEQUENCE OF statusData...}	the movementManeuverStatusData actually contains the channel number, a movement count, and then a sequence of the data that follows. That is not reflected in its current state.	The proposal appears to be an alternate method of presenting the same information. The existing method is consistent with the method used to describe block information in NTCIP 1202 v02.
75		SE	Noblis	RTM	Require ment 3.5.2.2.3 .8	Object 5.10.4.4 (overlapStatusGroupGreens) does not appear to meet the requirement	Consider replacing Object 5.10.4.4 with Object 5.10.4.3 (overlapStatusGroupYellows)	Correctness	Unfortunately, there's no specific status for FYA or FRA. The correct object it will be traced to depends on how it's wired. For a 3 section FYA, it's possible that the FYA is wired to the yellow, while fore a 4-section FYA, it may be wired to the green. Update to trace to both.
76		SE	Noblis	RTM	Require ment 3.5.2.2.3 .9	Object 5.10.4.4 (overlapStatusGroupGreens) does not appear to meet the requirement	Consider replacing Object 5.10.4.4 with Object 5.10.4.2 (overlapStatusGroupReds)	Correctness	Unfortunately, there's no specific status for FYA or FRA. The correct object it will be traced to depends on how it's wired. For a 3 section FYA, it's possible that the FYA is wired to the yellow, while fore a 4-section FYA, it may be wired to the green. Update to trace to both.
77		SE	Noblis	RTM	Require ment 3.5.2.2.7 .5	Object 5.10.4.4 (overlapStatusGroupGreens) does not appear to meet the requirement	Consider replacing Object 5.10.4.4 with Object 5.10.4.3 (overlapStatusGroupYellows)	Correctness	Unfortunately, there's no specific status for FYA or FRA. The correct object it will be traced to depends on how it's wired. For a 3 section FYA, it's possible that the FYA is wired to the yellow, while fore a 4-section FYA, it may be wired to the green. Update to trace to both.
78		SE	Noblis	RTM	Require ment 3.5.2.2.7 .6	Object 5.10.4.4 (overlapStatusGroupGreens) does not appear to meet the requirement	Consider replacing Object 5.10.4.4 with Object 5.10.4.2 (overlapStatusGroupReds)	Correctness	Unfortunately, there's no specific status for FYA or FRA. The correct object it will be traced to depends on how it's wired. For a 3 section FYA, it's possible that the FYA is wired to the yellow, while fore a 4-section FYA, it may be wired to the green. Update to trace to both.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
79		C	Siemens /DM	5	new	None	Guidance: The TSCBM is testable for conformance using the TSCBM Reader open source reference available on the USDOT Open Source Application Development Portal	To insure conformance and interoperability, USDOT developed open source code for a companion TSCBM reader	The ASC WG decided not to explicitly include TSCBM in NTCIP 1202 v03 but is discussed in Annex E.1.10.
80		C	Siemens /DM	5	new	None	Mandatory: The latency between the TSCBM signal states and the CU signal outputs shall be within +/- 50 mS	NTCIP v3 does not include performance requirements and therefore cannot be used for crash avoidance as written. TSCBM is testable by measuring the time difference between the reader output and the CU output to the signal head.	Added language in Annex E.1.10.
81		C	Intelight/ PR	5.4.9	Bit 0	"...When any of the CU Preempt inputs become active."	(Clarify what is a preempt input)	Need clarity if Advanced Preempt inputs are preempt inputs for this purposes. What about if serially connected to the Rail interface?	Ask ASC WG. If the ASC WG agrees, add, "including any advance preempt inputs." The ASC WG agreed there is insufficient time to properly consider support advanced preempt and support for IEEE 1570 at this time. Add language to Annex E. Remove the use case. Jon to add to the I/O mapping. 9/28. to be done.
82		C	Intelight/ PR	5.4.32 & 5.7.2.11	Bit 2	"Preempt Maximum Presence - Preempt maximum presence time exceeded"	Clarify what is included as a Preempt presence	IEEE 1570 suggests that Advance preempt notification could be 1-5 minutes. Is this included or not?	The ASC WG agreed there is insufficient time to properly consider support advanced preempt and support for IEEE 1570 at this time. Add language to Annex E. Remove the use case. Jon to add to the I/O mapping. 9/28. to be done.
83		C	Intelight/ PR	5.7	New	(missing)	Add new object "preemptRailStatus" as bit encoded integer. For each of the two rail preempts include Crossing Equipment Health, Advanced Notification Status.Communication Link Status	IEEE 1570 provides "crossing equipment health and warning system activity plus we can report what the communication link status is. We do have a preempt state (5.7.2.16) but this represents the state within the preempt sequence and not the state of the actual advanced preempt input. Do we need more than one Advanced Preempt input per Preempt channel?	The ASC WG agreed there is insufficient time to properly consider support advanced preempt and support for IEEE 1570 at this time. Add language to Annex E. Remove the use case. Jon to add to the I/O mapping. 9/28. to be done.
84		C	Intelight/ PR	5.7	New	(missing)	Need object(s) to assign preempt and advanced preempt "inputs" to IEEE 1570 rail communications link based data. Same with the gate information.	We expect 24V logic data on the Preempt inputs but IEEE 1570 can be a communications link instead.	The ASC WG agreed there is insufficient time to properly consider support advanced preempt and support for IEEE 1570 at this time. Add language to Annex E. Remove the use case. Jon to add to the I/O mapping. 9/28. to be done.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
85		C	Intelight/PR	MIB	new	(missing)	Add a new object to support darkening of LEDs in an ATCC cabinet, "modeATCCdisplays" as either bit-encoded or enumerated type. Values could be "normal", diagnostic, "sleep" (or off), "other" to start. This could be read-write, or read-only if just desired to report the status of how an ASC is configured.	Issues has been raised within the ATCC WG that the quantity, intensity, and operation (e.g. flashing) of LEDs on cabinet devices is excessive. An object should be included to program the ASC as to what modes of LEDs are supported. For example, "sleep" (off) could be programmed as a valid mode that the ASC would use of the cabinet door(s) are closed. Normal is full brightness and flashing all the time (conditioned by sleep mode), and diagnostic could be reduced brightness, etc unless a LED is trying to draw attention to a fault. By having it as a TMC object, global implementations can be supported across a traffic system.	Add an object/un/req, for managing the lights on the modeATCCdisplays. Enumerations are on/off/other. Other values are reserved. 9/28.
86		C	Intelight/PR	5.4.23.2.3	MIB	"...and by default, all available communications ports shall be enabled."	"...and by default, all available communications ports shall be disabled."	Consider disabling ports by default for security reasons.	Agreed, 9/28.
87		C	Intelight/PR	5.x	MIB	(new)	Add an object, channelToCmuMapping, that is compacted OERstring where bit 1..0 = Channel 1 CMU Index, bits 3..2 = Channel 2 CMU Index, etc. The Channel CMU Index equals CMU # minus 1	We need a way for the ASC to map the channel outputs to the correct CMU in cases of multiple CMUs within a cabinet and monitoring a single ASC device.	Add an object to the channelTable - CMU # (1..4). Bitmapped Description - need to handle the numbering for a CMU beyond (e.g., what if channel 17 is assigned to CMU #2 - would it be #1). Tabled - 9/28. Moved to add ANNEX E.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
88		O	Intelight/PR	5.x	MIB	(new)	Add an object,enableChannelOutputsStatus, as an encoded integer where bit 0 Enable TS Port 1, bit 0 Enable TS Port 1 Extended (channels 17-32), bit 2 = Enable CMU #1, Channels 1-16 only, bit 3 = Enable CMU #1, Channels 17-32 only, and bit 4 = CMU #1, Channels 1-32 (as single message), bit 5 = CMU #2 (all 32 channels), bit 6 = CMU #3 (all 32 channels), and bit7 = CMU #4 (all 32 channels). The ASC shall not expect a response from any device to a special channel output status message.	Multiple device such as video detection, audible ped signals, etc need the controller to output channel status (RYG) to monitor for advanced purposes. Currently, these products typically connect to parallel output points within the cabinet and these may not exist or will be difficult to access in the ATCC. Currently, some devices eavesdrop on the TS 2 Port 1 bus but this also should be extended to support 32 channels and also to inform the ASC not to expect a response from these special message. Note that in a TS 2 cabinet the MMU responds and these devices just listen.	Annex E - with the advent of more than 16 channels, this is something that has to be addressed, but the solution needs further discussion. 9/28.
89		SE	SIEMENS/AV	5.2.2.31		phaseAdvWarnStartTime	phaseAdvWarnGrnStartTime	Just to clarify that it's for the start of green warning.	Proposed change made.
90		SE	SIEMENS/AV	5.2.2.32		The amount of time, in tenths of a second for a range of 0.0 to 12.8 seconds,...	The amount of time, in tenths of a second for a range of 0.0 to 25.5 seconds,...	copy/paste error. The range for this object shows 0-255	Proposed change made.
91		O	SIEMENS/AV	5.2.2.33		phaseAltMinTimeTransition	remove	minimum times are used as a safety feature. phaseMinimumGreen is used as the least amount of time that a phase can safely be green. Why would we want to have an alternate time less than that during coord transition? Wouldn't that create unsafe conditions? Also, phaseAltMinTimeTransition wouldn't be greater than phaseMinimumGreen because it doesn't make sense to use a value _larger_ than phaseMinimumGreen during transitions, that defeats the purpose of transition. If users want a quicker time getting back into step, I would think that the only thing that needs to change is the manufacturer's software algorithms.	The intent was to allow a longer minimum green time for transitions, Should it just be transitions. Add to the description about longer green time. Remove for transitions only possibly - Patrick to research. Add The alternate minimum green cannot be less than minimum green for this phase. 9/28.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
92		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.15		A bit-mapped value as defined below for indicating the status of the options for a paired detector.	A bit-mapped value as defined below for configuring detector options.	Since the majority of this object is reserved, and the name is just generic to detectors, I suggest removing the 'paired detector' notion from the description	Proposed change made.
93		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.15		bit 1 0=OFF, 1=ON	bit 1 0=TRAIL, 1=LEAD	The other bits have more defined value labels, why not this one. Plus the labels didn't make sense when the name of the bit is "Detector Placement Option"	Proposed change made.
94		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.15		Single Detector Speed Mode Option.	Default Detector Speed Mode Option	Might be helpful to denote in the name of the bit that it's to be used in a failed-state environment. Not sure why this is a per-detector option and just not a global detector option. What are the chances that users want to calculate speed differently on a per detector basis?	Leave as is. 9/28/
95		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.15		OFF indicates a manufacturer specific calculation. ON indicates the use of the calculation Speed ...	CUSTOM indicates a manufacturer specific calculation. NTCIP indicates the use of the calculation Speed ...	description wasn't updated.	Proposed change made.
96		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.16		vehicleDetectorPairedDetector	description addition: Setting this value will automatically add this detector as the given detector's vehicleDetectorPairedDetector.	If you set this value to det B for det A, it's currently not defined what detector B's vehicleDetectorPairedDetector would be. I think we should explicitly state that det B's vehicleDetectorPairedDetector would be updated to det A. If not, you could get into an inconsistent state. det B is assigned as det A's; det C is assigned as det B's, etc. If the daisy-chain example was intended operation, then I think the "Detector Placement Option" is unnecessary as we can say if a detector has vehicleDetectorPairedDetector as non-zero, that it is always the leading detector.	Proposed change made.
97		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.18		SYNTAX INTEGER (1..4000 65535)	SYNTAX INTEGER (0..4000)	I believe 65535 was intended to be used to mean no set value; why not just use zero?	This is consistent with NTCIP 1209:sensorZoneAvgVehicleLength. INTEGER (1..4000). Approved 9/28. Ralph to check 65535 if not used. Add to text to be done, and default value.
98		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.2.19		SYNTAX INTEGER (1..65535)	SYNTAX INTEGER (0..4000)	Same as previous, just use zero to say 'no length' instead of saying the range is 1-65535 but 4001-65534 are unused.	This is consistent with NTCIP 1209:sensorZoneLength. INTEGER (1..65535). Approved. 9/28.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
99		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.5.4.3		detectorSpeed	detectorAvgSpeed	More precisely describes the object	Proposed change made.
100		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.5.4.3		SYNTAX INTEGER (0..255)	SYNTAX INTEGER (0..320)	78mph is not high enough as an upper limit. There are highways with 80mph speed limits. A value of 320 covers up to 100 mph.	Change to (0..511). Note: TSS goes to 255. 9/28.
101		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.5.7		This object indicates the number of seconds (1-3600 seconds) that comprise duration of the vehicle detector data collection period.	This object indicates the number of seconds (1-3600) that have elapsed in the current detector data collection period.	The original text is oddly worded and cryptic.	Proposed change made.
102		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.7.8		pedestrianButtonPush	pedestrianButtonPushTime	Proposed text better identifies the object as an amount of time.	Proposed change made.
103		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.3.7.8		A value of 0 indicates that all accessible pedestrian signal (APS) features are disabled.	A value of 0 indicates that accessible pedestrian signal (APS) features are disabled for the associated detector	Original text claims "all APS features are disabled" which hopefully wouldn't be the case.	Proposed change made.
104		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.3		This setting of this object shall be ignored if the unitUserDefinedBackupTime is set to a non-zero value.	The setting of this object shall be ignored if ...	This vs The.	Proposed change made.
105		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.10		Bit 1: Disable Remote Commands	remove	This is a poor attempt at security and I think will cause more headache than it's worth. Also, this hinders the ability of multiple managers configuring a single agent.	This was added not necessarily just for security but also for a maintenance worker who is working at the controller. Retain as modified. Patrick to add maintenance description.
106		O	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.22.3		unitTimeSourceCommanded	remove	This object can be consolidated with unitTimeSourceCurrent. If the managing agent wants to change the time source, they can set unitTimeSourceCurrent. Then there's only one object for time source, if they set it and it doesn't stay as what they set it to, then they know there's an issue.	
107		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.23.4		One cannot change the parameters of a port that is governed by a hardware specification or hardware standard (e.g. NEMA TS2 Port 1) and attempting to do so will result in a genErr response (one can SET the same values back to an object).	remove	I don't believe there are any parameters in EthernetConfigEntry that are governed by hardware specs, so this sentence can be removed. Also, the example (ts2 port) is not relevant at all.	To be removed.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
108		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.23.10		serialBus3Fault	remove	No controllers support a Serial Bus 3 timeout failure as SB 3 is between the CMU and AMU. Instead of separate objects for number of errors in the past 24 hours, why not just have one CMUStatus object.	If it is removed, then the requirement in "3.5.1.2.3.6 Monitor Polling Timeout - Serial Bus" will also need to be removed. Remove the object - CMUStatus object? Would also have to consider MMU faults, so leave it alone. 9/28.
109		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.31		Bit 4: Power Issues = Whenever the CU detects power issues such as brown-outs or power spikes but do not lead to a shutdown of the CU	remove	Seeing as how brownouts/power spikes typicall are short-lived, it doesn't make too much sense for this bit to exist if it's only supposed to be set "as long as the condition occurs"	Can be used to log the event. It's only brown outs or brief blackouts - can't detect power spikes. Update description. 9/28.
110		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.31		Bit 0: Communication timeout	remove	Given that controllers have multiple comm ports, it seems unhelpful to have a global "timeout" flag to cover all of them.	The timeout value might vary based on the port. Can be used to report when unitbackupTimer has expired. Will have to look at the appropriate comm port and RFC. Leave as it. 9/28.
111		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.4.32		Bit 1: Conflicts	remove	The controller is in charge of the signals. Why would it ever allow operation that it knows is invalid and then afterwards flag that it's a conflict?	The intent is with the data key and the controller may try to flag a conflict. Delete - 9/28. Note: update 2.3.a remove that these signal indications are not in conflict.
112		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.5.3		maximum3: the internal Maximum 2 Timing shall be effective while coordination is running a pattern	maximum3: the internal Maximum 3 Timing shall be effective while coordination is running a pattern	copy/paste error.	Proposed change made.
113		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.5.7.7		patternOptions	patternMaxMode	The existing name does not reflect what the object is	The ASC WG, during the SDD walkthrough, named this object so the additional bits can be used for new functions in the future. No change.
114		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.6.5		actionPlanControl		This object's definition makes no reference to the scheduler. Is the controller supposed to immediately interrupt what it was doing and implement this action? What about if the controller is in preempt or TSP? What about the time based scheduler?	Keep. Add language, When the action plan operations continue as if it has been activated by the time base scheduler. 9/28. A value shall deactivate the action plan and returns control to the what would normally have been in operation.
115		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.7.2.26		This object is used to locate information in the sequenceTable to use during the preempt dwell duration for this preempt.	This object is used to configure the sequence to run during the preempt's dwell duration.	The original text states that the sequence number is used to locate information; I assume the intended result is that the controller runs the sequence.	Changed to, "This object is used to configure the sequenceNumber to run during the preempt's dwell duration."

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
116		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.7.4		This object defines the preempt input number that is currently being serviced in the device	This object defines the preempt number that is currently being serviced	"input" here is unnecessary	Proposed change made.
117		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.13.7		ascPowerSource		If the controller is expected to determine its power source, there should be dedicated input types for each of these in the I/O section.	Will be a customized I/O mapping on the controller, but this object standardizes the reporting of the power source. 9/28. Add dc24VPower to ascPowerSource.
118		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.17.3.5		rsuPortWatchdogTime	add: This object is not used if rsuPortPollingPeriod is 0.	I believe this object is only used if the polling period is nonzero.	Proposed change made.
119		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.17.3.6		rsuPortWatchdogTimer	add: This object is not used if rsuPortPollingPeriod is 0.	text should be added to state when this object is not needed.	Proposed change made.
120		SE	SIEMEN S/AV	5.18.5.2		mapError and enabledLanesError		The description states that "the CU has stopped providing SPAT data" but it's not clear what that means. That data is available as normal NTCIP objects. Does that mean that the controller will deny GET attempts on those objects?	The intent was if there is an inconsistency found, the CU should not provide SPAT data.. Add language so Bits 12 and 13 in the spatStatus object are enabled, respectively. Need to clarify what happens for both push and pull.. 9/28. Remove the CU should stop providing SPAT data - the RSU should stop broadcasting data.
121		C	SIEMEN S/AV	5.19.1.1		rsuAsc		By having this in 1202, does this mean that when RSU manufacturers want to make updates for the NTCIP objects, should they update 1202? Or do they just not implement anything in this? I suggest removing this branch to avoid future maintenance troubles.	The contents of this node allows a TMC to monitor what is being broadcasted by the CV Roadside Process in case it is integral to the signal controller. If it's a separate physical RSU, it may not apply (i.e., selected as a user need). Note that there is a separate proposed effort for a TMC-RSU interface. Need to add language to clarify. Change 5.19 to rsuAsc.
122		C	SIEMEN S/AV	7.2.7.6		movementManeuverPedDetector	remove	The controller can already determine what phases (peds) conflict with other phases (and thus channels). This seems like an unnecessary object.	Leave as is. 9/28. Needed to determine which ped detector to use for ped conflicts.
123		C	SIEMEN S/AV	7.2.7.7.		movementManeuverBicycleDetector	remove	The controller can already determine what phases conflict with other phases (and thus channels). This seems like an unnecessary object.	Leave as is. 9/28. Needed to determine which bicycle detector to use for bicycle conflicts.
124			SIEMEN S/DM				spat blob		spat blob - not supported. And is not a conformant implementation. It does not use an NTCIP conformant encoding format. 9/28.
125		C	CST/Chan	Annex E.1.		includings	including	spelling	Proposed change made.

	A	B	C	F	G	H	I	J	K
1	No	O/C	CoOrg/ Indiv Inits	Sec	Para Table Fig	Existing Text	Proposed Text	Reason/ Explanation	Response
126		C	Siemens /DM	5	new	None	Mandatory: The CU shall broadcast a TSCBM to the RSU containing the information comprised of the SNMP data objects defined in Table 3-4 of the V2I Hub ICD at a rate of once per 100 milliseconds continually without interruption.	1. TSCBM was developed on a USDOT contract using a systems engineering process including ConOPs, Requirements, Field Test and widespread deployment by multiple CU manufacturers. 2. TSCBM avoids CU time mismatch to the RSU. The CU time of day is never used as part of the SPaT message, NTCIP v3 cannot be used for crash avoidance as written using mismatched CU time to the RSU. 3. TSCBM is taught in the USDOT Professional Capacity Building training modules	The ASC WG decided not to explicitly include TSCBM in NTCIP 1202 v03 but is discussed in Annex E.1.10.
127		C	CST/Chan	2.5.4.2.5		A manager needs to monitor the data included in a MAP data message broadcasted to connected devices. The MAP data message is expected to broadcasted in concert with the broadcast of the SPAT	A manager needs to monitor the data included in a SPAT data message broadcasted to connected devices. The SPAT data message is expected to broadcasted in concert with the broadcast of the MAP	inconsistent/wrong text.	Proposed change made.
128									
129			Totals	%					
130		5	Open	4.0%					
131		29	SE	23.2%					
132		0	SC	0.0%					
133		91	C	72.8%					
134		##	Grand Tot						